

# Torbay Racism Review Panel Report

---

## Contents

---

1.0 Foreword.....	2
2.0 Background / Context of Review .....	3
3.0 Key Findings - How do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic lives matter at Torbay Council?.....	5
4.0 Key Findings - How do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic lives matter at Torbay's public organisations? .....	7
5.0 Recommendations .....	9
6.0 Appendix One – Torbay Racism Review Panel Scope .....	10
7.0 Appendix Two – Action Notes from Public Torbay Racism Review Panel Meetings.....	12
Torbay Council 15 October 2020.....	12
Devon and Cornwall Police 25 November 2020 .....	15
Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service 8 December 2020 .....	23
Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust 21 January 2021 .....	25
Torbay Housing Providers 3 August 2021 .....	27
NHS Devon Clinical Commissioning Group 18 August 2021.....	31
South Devon College 8 November 2021 .....	34
National Black Police Association 17 November 2021 .....	36
Devon Partnership Trust 6 December 2021 .....	38

# 1.0 Foreword

---

Welcome to the report of the Torbay Racism Review Panel.

The panel has now been active for just under 18 months and although we have not completed all of the scope and questions which we set out to investigate and answer, we thought it was the right time to pause the review and report our findings and recommendations on our initial work.

The review has sought to investigate and understand what is happening in Torbay in relation to our ethnic minority community and has benefited from meeting a wide range of people who lead and work for organisations that deliver public services in Torbay as well as members of the ethnic minority community and other interested parties. I have been impressed throughout the review with the honesty and willingness our public organisations have to re-assess and change their approach to working with our ethnic community and I am confident that our findings and recommendations will be embraced by them so that we can make a real step change in Torbay to how we all live and work together in our community.

As ever with a review as complex as this one there are some stones left unturned and organisations we still want to meet and engage with, but the panel will hopefully return to these in due course. However, I am confident that we already have something powerful and compelling to say so I therefore encourage you to read the rest of the report for yourselves.

I would like to stress that as the review progressed, we have revised our terminology in relation to how we refer to ethnicity in line with central government advice issued in December 2021. This report therefore will use the term 'ethnic minority' apart from where historically the review has used the term BAME (Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic) such as in its original scope and action notes.

The review panel is clear that this report and its recommendations must not be another review that gets 'put on the shelf and forgotten' and that it is essential that the recommendations made by the panel are regularly reviewed so that progress and outcomes are clearly being monitored and delivered.

Finally, I would like to take this opportunity to thank all the people and organisations who contributed to this review either by meeting with us or by submitting information. I hope you can recognise your voice in our findings and recommendations. I would also like to thank the panel members whose commitment and insight has been invaluable at all stages of the review as well as our support officers Melissa and Mark.

Councillor Jermaine Atiya-Alla, Chair of the Torbay Racism Review Panel, Torbay Council

## 2.0 Background / Context of Review

---

This review has its origins in the awful events that took place in May 2020 in Minneapolis, USA when George Floyd was brutally murdered, and the resulting protests that occurred not only in the USA, but also across the UK. Torbay Council like many organisations and communities reflected on these events and took the decision that it wanted to undertake a meaningful review of racism in the community it serves.

There is always a danger when dealing with such an emotive issue such as racism, which is a multi-faceted, highly charged and complex issue to rush in and make a series of piecemeal responses that whilst well intentioned lack cohesion and a rationale and ultimately only serve in becoming ineffective in addressing the issue that it is trying to resolve. Torbay Council did not want to take this approach and instead wanted to undertake, as far as they could within their resources, a holistic, inclusive, and comprehensive approach to exploring and attempting to understand the issue of racism in Torbay, which engages with our community and allows them the space and time to voice their experiences and views to local community leaders as well as regional and national decision-makers.

In attempting to break down an appropriate approach to undertaking the review, the council established a review panel which consists of five councillors that reflect the political make-up of the council, as well as a number of co-opted panel members from the community who had knowledge and expertise that would support the panel throughout the review.

The review panel membership has been as follows:

- Councillor Jermaine Atiya-Alla – Chair of the panel
- Councillor John Thomas – Vice Chair of the panel
- Councillor Andrew Barrand
- Councillor Robert Loxton
- Councillor Steve Darling
- Kevin Dixon – Community Representative
- Maia Thomas – Community Representative
- Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo – Community Representative
- Rehan Uddin – Community Representative.

To start the review, the panel met in September 2020 to agree its scope and approach and decided to pose six key questions that they sought to answer as part of the review. These key questions were:

- How do we make BAME (Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic) lives matter in Torbay? - overarching question of the whole review
- How do we make BAME lives matter at Torbay Council?
- How do we make BAME lives matter at Torbay's public organisations?
- How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's community and voluntary sector?
- How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's business community?
- How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's culture and environment?

More detail on the scope of the review can be found at appendix 1 of this report.

The review panel then undertook a series of meetings (all the meetings were held virtually due to the covid pandemic restrictions and all in public unless indicated below) to seek answers to their key questions. A list of the panel meetings held is detailed below:

- 17 September 2020 – scoping meeting
- 15 October 2020 – Torbay Council – Anne-Marie Bond, CEO, Sue Wiltshire, Head of HR and Tara Harris, Divisional Director of Customer and Community
- 25 November 2020 – Devon and Cornwall Police – Chief Supt. Nikki Leaper, BCU Commander, Supt. Brent Davison, Local Policing Partnerships and PC Kate Marks, Diversity Officer
- 8 December 2020 – Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service – Audrey Gilding De Kort, Diversity and Inclusion Manager, Emma Willshaw, Diversity Officer, Yaz Murfin, Chair of Multi-Cultural Staff Network, Wayne Rawlins, Area Manager and Ryan Houghton, Policy Officer
- 21 January 2021 – Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust – Liz Davenport, CEO, Sir Richard Ibbotson, Chair of the Trust and Sunita Simadree, Chair of Devon BAME NHS Staff Network
- 29 April 2021 – Devon County Council – Jo Hooper, Equality and Diversity Officer (private meeting)
- 3 August 2021 – Westward Housing – Hayley Austin, Director of Housing and LiveWest – Julie Bingham, Regional Manager Neighbourhoods (On behalf of the Housing Association Sector)
- 18 August 2021 – Devon Clinical Commissioning Group – Jane Milligan, CEO, Andrew Millward, Director of Communications and Nellie Guttman, Senior Strategic Engagement Manager
- 30 September 2021 - Devon BAME NHS Staff Network (private meeting)
- 8 November 2021 – South Devon College – Laurence Frewin, Principal and CEO, Liz Lawrence, Assistant Principal and Kelly Sooben, Vice Principal
- 17 November 2021 – National Black Police Association (NBPA) – Andy George, President NBPA and Yvan Clarke, Devon and Cornwall Police BAME Staff Network
- 6 December 2021 – Devon Partnership NHS Trust – Melanie Walker, CEO, Andy Willis, Trust Chair and Laura Hobbs, Director of Corporate Affairs
- 1 February 2022 – Torbay Multi-Cultural Network – range of members from the network (private meeting)

Throughout the review the panel also received and considered a large number of written submissions and testimonies from a range of interested parties. This information has also been used by the panel in determining their findings, conclusions and recommendations.

At the conclusion of the above meetings and evidence gathering, the panel made a decision to pause the review to report their interim findings and recommendations on the first two key questions. The panel's reasoning for pausing the review was mainly due to the longer than anticipated time taken to answer the first two questions, in part caused by the availability of key stakeholders due to the covid pandemic. The panel therefore decided to split the review into part one (this report) and part two (a future report which will address the outstanding key questions).

The panel were also aware that due to the complications caused by the covid pandemic that they were unable to engage with schools on the issue of racism and diversity. Therefore, the panel will pick up this strand in its future work.

It is also worth noting at this point that the review underwent a name change during its first twelve months. Initially the review had been named 'How do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) lives matter in Torbay Review Panel?' but after some feedback from the community the name was changed to the 'Torbay Racism Review Panel'.

Finally, the panel were unanimous that any review of racism needed to engage with our ethnic minority community in Torbay as well as consider views from our non-ethnic minority community. Perhaps naively the panel thought engagement with the ethnic minority community would be relatively straight forward, but it proved to be more difficult than first anticipated. Therefore, the panel took an early decision to establish a multi-cultural network for Torbay with help from the council, Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service and Engaging Communities Southwest. Whilst this network is still in its infancy it is starting to bring together a range of people in Torbay from multi-cultural backgrounds and is enabling a channel of communication to open-up between our ethnic minority community and the organisations of Torbay. In time it is hoped that this network will work with other networks locally and regionally, so that the views and experiences of our ethnic minority communities are reflected and accessible to the organisations in Torbay and beyond that, to shape the services we receive.

### 3.0 Key Findings - How do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic lives matter at Torbay Council?

---

The headline findings made by the panel below were based on the action notes taken at the meetings (which are included at appendix 2 of this report), the views and recollections from panel members and the submissions made by interested parties. The headline findings in relation to the key question are:

- Torbay Council needs to do more to recruit and retain an ethnically diverse workforce
- Torbay Council needs to do more work with the political parties in Torbay to encourage ethnic minority candidates to stand for election as councillors
- Torbay Council needs to do more to engage meaningfully with Torbay's ethnically diverse community via a range of reference groups - but this engagement must be sustained and not only activated when the council wants something from the ethnic minority community
- Torbay Council needs to ensure that the voice of children and young people is heard in Torbay in relation to race and racism and therefore should facilitate a survey collecting their views as well as using social media channels such as Instagram, TikTok and Facebook. However, face to face school visits should also be part of this engagement
- Torbay Council needs to gather the views of ethnic minority staff and councillors regularly, so that their views about working at the council can be taken into account in changing the organisational culture of the council
- Torbay Council needs to do more to address racism that exists in our community by being the community leader and role model on this issue
- As a matter of urgency Torbay Council needs to do more to improve its collection and analysis of data on ethnic minority staff and our ethnic minority customer base and community, to ensure

that it is accurate, up to date and is used to improve the services we offer to staff and the wider community

- Torbay Council, as part of its community leadership role, needs to develop, in partnership with other organisations, a full programme of multi-cultural events to celebrate our diverse community and to encourage better understanding between communities. This should include education establishments in Torbay
- Torbay Council needs to manage and monitor its Facebook page more robustly to immediately remove racist comments left by some contributors and report incidents of racism that take place on the council's Facebook page to the police if necessary
- Torbay Council needs to review its delivery of housing services to the ethnic minority community to ensure it meets their needs, but should also undertake reviews in all service areas of the council to ensure that current service delivery meets the needs of our ethnic community
- Torbay Council needs to work with other public sector bodies in Torbay to establish a public sector ethnic minority staff network
- Torbay Council needs to review its training and development programmes for staff and elected members to ensure it reflects the right levels of insight into cultural diversity, so that the organisational culture of Torbay Council provides the right environment to serve our ethnic minority community. The panel is clear that all diversity training should be mandatory, it should include unconscious bias training for all councillors and senior officers, and it should include input from our ethnic minority community
- Torbay Council, as a matter of urgency, needs to appoint a dedicated and full-time equality and diversity officer to lead and support the organisation on a cohesive approach for all aspects of equality, diversity and inclusion and to work with partners and the community to develop a better understanding of the Torbay community and its needs. The panel are clear that any recruitment process should have significant input from our ethnic minority community
- Torbay Council should ensure that one of its Cabinet Leads has a clear responsibility and oversight of equality and diversity
- Torbay Council needs to ensure that any changes to the way it approaches cultural diversity is mirrored by its wholly owned companies TDA Group and SWISCo
- Torbay Council, as the community leader on this issue, needs to develop a partnership of the public bodies in Torbay to address the issue of racism jointly rather than in organisational silos
- Torbay Council needs to address the barriers that exist to ethnic minorities wanting to come and live and work in Torbay – these barriers include:
  - Appropriate and affordable housing
  - Wide range of job opportunities
  - A welcoming culture and environment.

## 4.0 Key Findings - How do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic lives matter at Torbay's public organisations?

---

When referring to Torbay's public organisations, this report is referring to the following organisations that operate services to residents and visitors in Torbay and in this instance includes the Housing Association Sector:

- Torbay Council
- Devon and Cornwall Police
- Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service,
- South Devon College
- Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust
- Devon Clinical Commissioning Group
- Devon Partnership NHS Trust
- Westward Housing
- LiveWest

The headline findings made by the panel below were based on the action notes taken at the meetings (which are included at appendix 2 of this report), the views and recollections from panel members and the submissions made by interested parties.

The headline findings in relation to the key question are outlined below and for the majority will require a joint approach between Torbay's public organisations rather than an organisational silo approach:

- As a matter of urgency Torbay's public organisations need to do more to improve their collection and analysis of data on ethnic minority staff and their ethnic minority customer base and community, to ensure that it is accurate and up to date and is used to improve the services they offer to staff and the wider community. Public organisations need to utilise currently available channels to gather complete and thorough demographic data, specifically identifying areas related to ethnic minority staff, customer base and community. The organisations need to provide managers with data collection training, where data teams can lead this training to understand data collection and analysis scope better. An organisational wide data collection framework needs to be formed to ensure all organisations collect, record, and analyse this data correctly and efficiently. Annual reporting on race detailing resources spent, activities carried out, feedback and a 12-month plan for the following year would be beneficial
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to celebrate Torbay's cultural diversity by holding a programme of events to bring our community together. This should include championing and celebrating the ethnic minority businesses that operate in Torbay. Plans should be led/guided by voices of those with lived experience of different cultures, with the opportunity for local communities to be involved in the planning and running of the events
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to engage and build trust and confidence with the ethnic minority community in Torbay. The panel were told by people from an ethnic minority that just because they do not ask for help, it does not mean they don't want help. This could be achieved by holding regular focus groups to ensure their voices are heard, as an example

- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to recruit and retain an ethnically diverse workforce. Torbay's public organisations need to review their current recruitment practice, policies and identify any barriers that may stop ethnic minorities from applying or obtaining positions. A more significant effort is required to recruit and retain an ethnically diverse workforce, with outlined targets and data used for guidance
- Torbay's public organisations need to address language differences that exist between them and some of the ethnic minority community. A strategy to ensure accessibility to public services would be advisable, alongside diversity and inclusion training with a focus on language and communication to support this
- Torbay's public organisations need to embrace Reverse Mentoring (where ethnic minority staff and community representatives mentor senior leaders on issues facing the ethnic minority community) as a model to promote cultural diversity within their executive and non-executive senior leaders. They also need to ensure training for mentees on diversity and inclusion has occurred, to ensure they are able and ready to engage with this programme and not cause any harm to mentors. A safe space and wellbeing support should also be made available to all mentors which can include coaching and counselling
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to develop shared cultural diversity training and cultural competency frameworks for staff, but this training must be co-designed with ethnic minority staff and the wider community
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to address the disproportionate impact of mental health on the ethnic minority community in relation to the covid pandemic
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to jointly develop, fund and support a Torbay ethnic minority community network
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to develop measurable objectives on racial equality based on co-production with ethnic minority staff and the wider ethnic minority community
- Torbay's public organisations need to do more to improve their processes for the reporting of racist incidents for staff and the wider community, including wider promotion of existing ways to report hate crimes. An analysis of current data channels would be needed to identify gaps, potential risks of harm and changes needed to ensure reporting can be done safely and independent of line managers, who in some situations may be causing harm
- Torbay's public organisations need to regularly work together to revisit the issue of racism and how it impacts on our community via a formal review similar to the review undertaken by this panel. The panel would like to see this undertaken at least every 3 years
- Torbay Council and Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust need to work together to support ethnic minority care home workers as they can often miss out on support due to the isolated nature of their work. Both organisations should also be mindful of other isolated ethnic minority staff who may require support, such as home workers and those who work in the community
- Devon and Cornwall Police need to do more to support ethnic minority police officers, so they do not feel isolated and forced to subvert their cultural identity to fit into the organisational culture of the police. A resourced, safe peer to peer network where individuals can identify opportunities for support and share experiences would be beneficial as part of this, but not limited to



- Devon and Cornwall Police need to support the NBPA on their lobbying campaign for the removal of the C grade at GCSE in English for candidates who want to become police officers, as it disadvantages those who have been educated overseas and precludes them from applying. An equivalent qualification or test of English skills would be more appropriate with assistance to undertake this test being funded and supported by the police
- Devon and Cornwall Police need to evaluate their recruitment processes for police officers to ensure there is no bias against ethnic minority candidates. Within the process of evaluating, data should be used to recognise gaps in demographics and a targeted strategy approach used to ensure opportunity for all
- Devon and Cornwall Police need to ensure that they are a police force where the NBPA is given access to new officers, especially officers from an ethnic minority, at induction, so they can support them in their role
- Devon and Cornwall Police need to support the establishment of a local branch of the NBPA
- Whilst the panel acknowledge the excellent work carried out by the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner's scrutiny panel 'Use of Police Powers Community Scrutiny Panel', it still considers that Devon and Cornwall Police need to focus further on the stop and search figures in relation to the ethnic minority community and seek as a matter of urgency to reduce the disparity gaps inherent in these statistics

## 5.0 Recommendations

---

1. That Cabinet, as a matter of urgency, appoint a dedicated and full time Equality and Diversity Officer for Torbay Council to develop and implement an action plan that addresses all the key findings detailed in this report. This action plan will include actions relating to both those specifically for Torbay Council, as well as joint actions for Torbay's public organisations, but will not include those directed specifically to Devon and Cornwall Police which form a separate recommendation below.
2. That Cabinet requests that Torbay's public organisations recognise the key findings and commit to working with each other to deliver the joint actions outlined in the action plan referenced at recommendation one above. Joint actions should be coupled with measurable outcomes, time commitment and strategy on how to deliver.
3. That Cabinet requests that Devon and Cornwall Police recognise the key findings related to them in this report and commit to address them as a matter of urgency. Actions need to be addressed with measurable goals with a time commitment.
4. That Cabinet request (as part of the action plan referenced at recommendation one above) that, as a matter of urgency, Torbay's public organisations work together to improve the collection and analysis of data on ethnic minority staff, their ethnic minority customer base and community to ensure that it is accurate, up to date and is used to improve the services they offer to staff and the wider community. Public organisations need to utilise currently available channels to gather complete and thorough demographic data, specifically identifying areas related to ethnic minority staff, customer base and community. The organisations need to provide managers with data collection training, where data teams can lead this training to understand data collection and

analysis scope better. An organisational wide data collection framework needs to be formed to ensure all organisations collect, record, and analyse this data correctly and efficiently. Annual reporting on race detailing resources spent, activities carried out, feedback and a 12-month plan for the following year would be beneficial.

5. That Cabinet request that the recommendations above be reviewed by the Torbay Racism Review Panel in six months to monitor progress on their delivery. Transparency in response to the recommendations alongside all progress, challenges and any difficulties would be necessary.

## 6.0 Appendix One – Torbay Racism Review Panel Scope

---

# TORBAY COUNCIL

## How do we make Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) lives matter in Torbay Review Panel

### Scoping Document

#### Objective of the Review

To review the question – How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay?

#### Scope of the Review

1. How do we make BAME lives matter at Torbay Council?
2. How do we make BAME lives matter at Torbay's public organisations?
3. How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's community and voluntary sector?
4. How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's business community?
5. How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay's culture and environment?

#### Rationale for the Review

- 1.1 In the light of the recent protests relating to the Black Lives Matter agenda due to the death of George Floyd in Minneapolis, USA in May 2020 and protests in cities such as London and Bristol in the UK this scoping document has been produced to detail the scope of Torbay Council's response to this issue.
- 1.2 When responding to such a multi-faceted, highly charged and complex issue as the Black Lives Matter agenda there is the potential to rush into making a series of piecemeal responses which whilst well intentioned lack cohesion and ultimately become fragmented and ineffective in delivering the objective they were designed to achieve. What is suggested is a holistic, inclusive and comprehensive approach to exploring the issue of racism in Torbay which engages with the community and allows them the space and time to voice their experiences and views to civic leaders and local and national decision makers.
- 1.3 It is proposed that Torbay Council undertake a review of racism in Torbay and pose as the key question of the review – How do we make BAME lives matter in Torbay?

1.4 Whilst there have been similar national reviews, what is being proposed here is a review in the locality of Torbay which has not been undertaken before.

#### **Potential Consultees**

- Senior Officers of Torbay Council
- Torbay Council Staff
- Torbay Council customers
- Devon and Cornwall Police
- Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner for Devon, Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly
- Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust
- Devon Partnership NHS Trust
- South Western Ambulance Service NHS Trust
- South Devon College
- Torbay's primary, secondary and special schools
- Language Schools
- Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service
- Jobcentre Plus
- Probation Service
- Magistrates Court
- Staff of Torbay's public organisations
- Customers of Torbay's public organisations
- Devon Black and Asian and Minority Ethnic Network
- South Devon Against Racism Alliance
- Plymouth and Devon Racial Equality Council
- Torbay Community Development Trust
- Torbay's community and voluntary sector organisations
- Torbay Business Forum
- English Riviera BID Company
- TDA
- Torbay's businesses
- Torbay's wider community

#### **Review Panel**

The review panel membership has been as follows:

- Councillor Jermaine Atiya-Alla – Chair of the panel
- Councillor John Thomas – Vice Chair of the panel
- Councillor Andrew Barrant
- Councillor Robert Loxton
- Councillor Steve Darling
- Kevin Dixon – Community Representative
- Maia Thomas – Community Representative
- Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo – Community Representative
- Rehan Uddin – Community Representative.

Cabinet will consider the report of the Panel in summer 2022. Once the report has been adopted it will be forwarded to the appropriate decision-makers.

## 7.0 Appendix Two – Action Notes from Public Torbay Racism Review Panel Meetings

---

Torbay Council 15 October 2020

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla, Councillor John Thomas, Councillor Barrant, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Darling, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Councillor Brooks, Councillor Howgate, Councillor Kennedy, Councillor Law, Anne-Marie Bond (Interim Chief Executive, Torbay Council), Tara Harris (Assistant Director Customer and Community, Torbay Council) and Sue Wiltshire (Head of Human Resources, Torbay Council).**

The Chair welcomed Anne-Marie Bond (Interim Chief Executive, Torbay Council), Tara Harris (Assistant Director Customer and Community, Torbay Council) and Sue Wiltshire (Head of Human Resources, Torbay Council) to the meeting and the panel then directed a number of questions to them based around the key question of how do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) lives matter at Torbay Council?

The key responses from the council officers are detailed below:

- It was agreed that the council needed to ensure that its foster care provision was ethnically diverse
- It was stated that the council has not historically had a targeted campaign to address diversity in its workforce but that this was now being addressed via the development of a revised workforce or people strategy that would make diversity a focus with support from the Local Government Association (LGA)
- That the council's workforce was most ethnically diverse in social care roles and in agency staff
- That the council's approach to adoption of children was that the process was primarily about the child's needs
- That in developing its workforce plan the council would consider implementing a target for the employment of BAME staff but would take advice from the LGA on this approach
- That whilst Torbay Council has a low BAME workforce of 1.3% in comparison to other councils it does aspire to be representative of the community it serves and the council acknowledges that it needs to do better on this moving forward. To date its approach has been 'one size fits all' rather than targeted but that it needs to make improvements on this issue
- That austerity has made addressing ethnic diversity in the council workforce more difficult as the council has had to focus on a range of issues with less money
- The interim Chief Executive is committed to the council reaching out and engaging with all sectors in its community and is currently consulting the community on the council's consultation strategy

- That the council's approach to BAME staff has to be more than targets but a wider set of initiatives, campaigns and policies to encourage BAME staff to work and stay with the council
- Council is clear that it does not tolerate racism and that it needs to work with the community more to address racism in Torbay
- Council admitted that some of its BAME data was old and dating back to the 2011 census but that the 2021 census data would provide the council with a much better picture of its community and how the council can provide support to the BAME community
- At times the council found it hard to collect data on ethnicity as respondents were not required to answer this question on forms
- The council was clear that its approach to addressing ethnic diversity in its workforce also had to happen in its arms-length companies of SWISCo and TDA
- That the council had not historically marked Black History Month but that it would consider doing in the future
- That the council works closely with the local police to ensure hate crimes are reported but that more could be done to promote this possibly via the Community Safety Partnership and/or Prevent Partnership
- That the BAME community faces a number of barriers in reporting hate crime, these being trust in the institutions they are reporting it to e.g. police and council as well as cultural barriers
- Possibly the focus in Torbay on hate crime has been more on the LGBT community rather than BAME community
- That the council does not specifically collect data on housing and BAME customers and therefore there appears to be no issues with housing but it was acknowledged that this may not be the truth of the issue. The council is therefore keen to explore how it can encourage the BAME community to come forward and report issues or to access advocacy support
- The council's data on BAME access to housing is partial but part of the reason for this was the issue of customers not being under an obligation to disclose their ethnicity on forms or contacts with the council
- The council acknowledges and is currently working to raise standards in the private rented housing sector to address housing deprivation that may also impact BAME community but the council needs to find ways to encourage BAME community to come forward and complain about poor housing. The Council is currently exploring how to reach some communities who don't historically interact with the council and is looking to use targeted social media to do this
- The council needs to review the management of its Facebook page as some racist comments appear on it from members of the public
- Panel considered the possibility of a future review specifically on Housing and BAME
- The council has undertaken an initiative to work with local BAME businesses but this is targeted more at restaurants and hospitality industry to aid compliance. Nevertheless this work has been acknowledged as best practice nationally
- The council has a link to a BAME staff support network at the hospital trust but no council dedicated BAME Staff network

- Council does run equality and diversity training but does recognise more could be done to support and train staff on these issues
- The council acknowledged that it has a low number of BAME councillors but stated that it was only the council's role to encourage candidates and that political parties also had a role to play on this issue
- That the council has for some time not had a dedicated diversity officer
- That the council could consider doing more to work with local schools to promote BAME culture and understanding
- That there was no specific diversity and inclusion training for councillors as part of their induction.

The following actions were identified by the panel:

- Numbers on ethnic diversity of Foster Carers in Torbay to be provided to panel – Nancy Meehan, Director of Children's Services, Torbay Council
- Clarification on ethnic diversity and role it plays in selecting parents for adoption of children in Torbay to be provided to panel – Nancy Meehan, Director of Children's Services, Torbay Council
- Workforce Strategy to be reviewed by BAME Review Panel before consideration by Cabinet – Sue Wiltshire, Head of Human Resources, Torbay Council and Mark Hammett, Strategic Support Manager, Torbay Council
- BAME staff figures for SWISCO and TDA to be provided to panel - Sue Wiltshire, Head of Human Resources
- BAME figures on access to housing to be provided to panel - Tara Harris Assistant Director Customer and Community, Torbay Council
- BAME figures of modern slavery in Torbay to be provided to panel - Tara Harris Assistant Director Customer and Community, Torbay Council
- Overview of how council works with schools to promote BAME culture to be provided to the panel – Rachael Williams, Head of Education, Torbay Council

## Devon and Cornwall Police 25 November 2020

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla, Councillor John Thomas, Councillor Barrant, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Darling, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Councillor Brooks, Councillor Kennedy, Councillor Dave Thomas, Councillor Chris Lewis, Councillor Barbara Lewis, Councillor Bye, Councillor Hill, Councillor Jackie Thomas, and Councillor Manning.**

**Chief Superintendent Nikki Leaper – South Devon Commander, Superintendent Brent Davison – South Devon Partnerships Lead, Sergeant Dylan Bristow – Diverse Communities Team Leader, Constable Kate Marks – Diverse Communities Officer for South Devon, Susan Stratton - Equality and Diversity Officer Devon and Cornwall Police**

The chair welcomed the representatives of Devon and Cornwall Police and explained that he had invited the Police and Crime Commissioner for Devon and Cornwall Police to the meeting but that due to a clash of meetings she was unable to attend but this should not be interpreted as a reflection of her lack of interest and commitment to the issue. However, the Police and Crime Commissioner had provided the panel with a written submission and the panel will review this and consider whether they wish to invite the commissioner to a future meeting of the panel.

Chief Superintendent Nikki Leaper presented data on proportionality in Torbay and South Devon and then the panel member and other councillors present directed a number of questions to her and other police representatives based around the key question of how do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) lives matter at Torbay's public organisations?

The key responses from the police representatives are detailed below:

- There was a clear admission that the data collected by the police was incomplete especially around ethnicity and that this made it difficult to accurately understand the extent as to how police activities impacted on Torbay's BAME community
- It was identified that there were many barriers to accurately collecting this data and that language barriers in Torbay may be more widespread than first understood
- The data collected also faces other challenges in how a distinction is made between Torbay residents vs Torbay visitors as well as the need to ensure that the data on ethnicity was collected consistently across the force area so like for like comparisons could be made
- A particular issue with the ethnicity data was that county lines activity could distort the local figures
- The police recognise that to place the data in context they require the BAME data from the 2021 census and also need to work with other partner organisations to share data where appropriate
- That the police recognise that they need to build trust with communities over the use of stop and search and are currently working with independent advisors from the community to shape this and other policy approaches
- The police recognise they need to do more to obtain the 'lived experiences' of the BAME community to shape their approach and policy towards policing in Torbay and are setting up a South Devon Reference Group to address this
- That the police are open to working with the local community of Torbay to find ways to build trust and confidence in the police – they see this as societal issue not just a police issue

- Admission from police that they could do more to address racism and trust and confidence in them via schools and colleges and also use this as an opportunity to recruit young people into the police especially from the BAME community
- In answer to challenge from the panel on why so many BAME people are subject to stop and search the police representatives stated that it was still not clear but that work was ongoing to look at this via an Office for the Police and Crime Commissioner Scrutiny Panel
- The police explained that officers do undertake unconscious bias training and also undertake an equality and diversity module
- Panel members asked for the Torbay figures on proportionality to be placed in context with those for Plymouth and Exeter and it was explained that Torbay's figures were similar to those for Cornwall but that Exeter's figures were a little higher and Plymouth's a little lower but that the figures were all quite similar
- It was explained that out of 244 senior police officers in the Devon and Cornwall Police there were 5 BAME inspectors and that the BAME workforce in the force was approximately 1.3% but that the police recognise that they need to do more to attract BAME people to work in police not just as officer but also in support roles
- The police explained that they needed to really understand the barriers that were stopping the BAME community joining the police force but that these could be that they perceive the force as racist, they are concerned about their career prospects because they are BAME, a fear of facing racism from the public and the element of danger of being a front line police officer
- The police questioned whether they had BAME role models in the force for the BAME community to look up to and that it was intimidating to join an organisation where the majority of staff were white.

Members of the public then had the opportunity to ask questions and the key responses from the police representatives are detailed below:

- It was explained that the Devon and Cornwall Police were considering drafting an Anti-Racism Policy to specifically address racism both internally and externally
- There was a need to challenge and educate the older population in Torbay on race and ethnicity as well as the younger generation and that this could be achieved by a greater emphasis on diversity events and visibility of BAME culture in Torbay, particular reference was made to the Into the Mix Festival that previously took place in Torbay but that to be successful this festival and other events needed support from organisations such as the council
- There was a discussion around whether the term 'hate crime' was the best description of the activity that takes place against the BAME community and whether a more specific term or definition is required

The following actions were identified by the panel:

- Police presentation on proportionality to be sent to all panel members – Melissa Nicholson
- Panel requested data on % of stop and search activity that was justified in Torbay – Melissa Nicholson/Nikki Leaper
- Police to respond on whether stop and search figures included foot and vehicle stops - Melissa Nicholson/Nikki Leaper



- Police to provide Councillor Advocate details to panel members and Councillor MacGregor from Teignbridge District Council - Melissa Nicholson/Nikki Leaper



**Submission to:** Torbay Council – Review Panel Meeting - 25 November 2020

**From:** Police and Crime Commissioner, Devon, Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly

**Date:** 24/11/2020

**Area of work:** *How do we make Black, Asian and minority ethnic lives matter in Torbay?*

## **Introduction**

Firstly, I must apologise that I cannot be with you in person. Please do not see this as my lack of commitment to your efforts. I am already booked at a public meeting in another area of Devon. After conversation with Cllr Jermaine Atiya-Alla to discuss my absence it was suggested that I produce a written submission.

I thought it would be helpful to firstly be clear about my role. It is still classified as a 'new' role as the first election for a Police and Crime Commissioner was in November 2012 and I was elected in May 2016. There are still many misunderstandings about what a Commissioner can or cannot do in their role so some clarity may help you better phrase any suggestions you may have following your discussions. I look forward to hearing the results of your considerations.

## **What is the role of a Police and Crime Commissioner?**

The role of a Police and Crime Commissioner is to be the voice of the people in policing, and to hold the Chief Constable to account for how he/she discharges their functions. The aim of all Commissioners is to ensure the delivery of an effective and efficient police service within their force area.

Commissioners are responsible for 'the totality of policing' (i.e. all of policing, not just some parts of it) but they 'must not fetter the operational independence of the police force and the Chief Constable who leads it'.

By law (the Police Reform and Social Responsibility Act 2011), Commissioners have to do certain things, such as:

1. secure an efficient and effective police force for their area;
2. appoint the Chief Constable, hold them to account for running the force, and if necessary dismiss them;
3. set the police and crime objectives for their area through a police and crime plan;
4. set the force budget and determine the precept (i.e. the levy on the council tax bill that will go toward policing);
5. hold the Chief Constable to account for how the force contributes to the national and international policing capabilities set out by the Home Secretary; and

6. bring together community safety and criminal justice partners (i.e. other organisations and agencies), to make sure local priorities are joined up.

### **The difference between the Chief Constable and the Police and Crime Commissioner**

The Police and Crime Commissioner and Devon and Cornwall Police are two separate entities. Although the Commissioners must appoint and may, in extreme circumstances, dismiss the Chief Constable, the Commissioner is not the Chief Constable's employer. It is a Crown Service with an oath sworn to the Queen.

The Chief Constable and the Commissioner have lots of responsibilities and their roles are different. The table below does not list all their individual duties, but does aim to show the main differences between the two roles:

<b>Chief Constable</b> <b>Is a Corporation Sole</b>	<b>Police and Crime Commissioner</b> <b>Is a Corporation Sole</b>
Must deliver an effective police force and has direct control over the force, its officers and staff.	Makes sure that the views/needs of residents and businesses inform how our police service operates.
Leads and makes decisions on all aspects of operational policing. However, they must have regard to the Police and Crime Plan and manage the day to day budget of policing.	Sets the police's priorities through a Police and Crime Plan and decides how much money the police force will be given each year to operate.
Is the most senior police officer in Devon and Cornwall Police	Acts on behalf of the electorate and ensures that the Chief Constable is delivering effective policing by holding them to account.
Is responsible for the delivery of operational policing and overall performance of the police.	Decides what the council tax contribution towards policing (the precept) is.
Politically independent.	Elected into office.
Accountable to the Commissioner.	Accountable to the public.

### **Background**

My Police and Crime Plan has the ambition to create Safe, Resilient and Connected communities. It was put in place to serve a policing area that is diverse in its people and geography, with remote rural areas alongside urban centres and coastal communities.

I am working alongside our police force to ensure that it better reflects the make up of the force area that it serves and the services we provide are more suited to our residents. The local and national uplift in police officers has created a once-in-a-generation opportunity to be more inclusive

and representative of the communities policing serves. We are having the biggest investment in policing in a decade.

There is significant work to be done. Recent research by Devon and Cornwall Police and based on the 2011 Census shows that between April 2019 and March 2020 police were 12 times more likely to stop and search a black person than they were a white person, black people were three times more likely to be victims of crime and 9.5 times more likely to be subjected to police force.

The proportion of black and minority ethnic staff and officers in Devon Police is lower than it is in the wider population of the two counties and five inhabited islands.

Next year a census will be carried out that is likely to show that the proportion of black, minority ethnic and refugee communities in our force area has increased since the last census. The requirement to tackle racism, hate crime and disproportionality in the staffing of our public services is therefore more urgent than ever.

Fortunately, there is significant, highly prioritised and ongoing work by my office to address these challenges.

My strategy is based on the following activity:

### **Commissioning of services**

In the year to May 2020, while overall crime fell, there was a 3.1% increase in hate crime reported in the Devon and Cornwall Police area (see breakdown below). In recent years there has been a significant effort to encourage reporting of hate crime. You will see regular activity from my office to encourage hate crime reporting.

Type	Jun-2019 to May-2020	Jun-2018 to May-2019	% Change
<b>Totals</b>	<b>1856</b>	<b>1800</b>	<b>3.1%</b>
Racial	1054	1072	-1.7%
Sexual Orientation	344	296	16.2%
Disability	244	197	23.9%
Religion	93	102	-8.8%
Transgender	84	85	-1.2%
Sex or Gender	63	41	53.7%
Other	80	76	5.3%

The Crown Prosecution Service, in partnership with the police, maintains a high level of convictions for hate crime in relation to other crime types (85% for 12 months to March 2020) and in doing so continues to send the message that perpetrators will be dealt with robustly through the courts.

Police and Crime Commissioners have a responsibility for victim care and it is important that these are delivered sensitively in relation to racial and cultural differences. My office is presently restructuring how it delivers these services and has embarked on a significant procurement exercise. Understanding what support is needed by residents in our black and minority ethnic communities, and seeking to address these needs, is included in that effort. We are embarking on a new long-term strategic partnership to ensure that victim services are accessible and available when they are needed.

Organisations that are currently part of the Victim Care Network that provide services specifically for minority groups include North Devon Sunrise, the Plymouth and Devon Racial Equality Council, Stop Hate UK and the Ubuntu Counselling Service.

### **Leading workforce change in Devon and Cornwall Police and my office**

My role is to formally scrutinise Devon and Cornwall Police. I do this through independent scrutiny panels and publish summary reports on their findings and recommendations on my website.

The aim is to identify what is working well along with opportunities for improvement.

Last year one of my scrutiny panels completed a review into how Devon and Cornwall Police uses its powers to stop and search. The panel's findings and recommendations can be read online at [www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk/about-us/scrutiny/scrutiny-meetings-and-documents/](http://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk/about-us/scrutiny/scrutiny-meetings-and-documents/)

Torquay Police Station has its own custody centre, and one of my statutory functions is the delivery of an Independent Custody Visiting Scheme. The scheme comprises a wide range of volunteers who undertake independent visits to custody centres and engage with detainees to ensure that safety and welfare standards are maintained. The scheme is still being delivered through technology as part of our COVID safe protocols and retains its Silver Award from the Independent Custody Visiting Association.

Scrutiny of activities in this way represents a vital method of challenging the status quo and whenever possible should be done in the public eye, with maximum transparency. My office has received a Transparency award for four years running by an organisation called Comparing Police and Crime Commissioners for the level of information that is available to the public via our website [www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk](http://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk) – something of which we are rightly proud.

In terms of co-ordinating activity relating to racial disparity the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner has formed an Equality and Diversity Working Group.

### **Listening to the public to understand their views and any concerns**

Between January 2019 and March 2020, before face-to-face engagement activities were curtailed, my office attended 21 public events across the force area that were aimed at diverse communities. At these events members of the public were encouraged to take part in surveys, sign up to my Neighbourhood Alert newsletter and had victim of crime services explained to them.

One of these events, "Into the Mix" was a multi-diversity event held in Torbay for the first time which received significant funding from my office in recognition of the fact that it was the only upper tier local authority in the Devon and Cornwall Police area that did not have a significant annual event in celebration of diversity.

The event held in the grounds of Torre Abbey was deemed a success with feedback from local families who gave their heartfelt thanks for enabling the opportunity. It also enabled all public sector and voluntary agencies a chance to learn and engage with Torbay's diverse communities. Yet there was a lack of presence from senior leaders who participated and only the local MP and myself were there to represent Torbay Together, of which we are both members. I do not underestimate the impact on community cohesion and building trusting relationships in us all at such events.

I am currently in the process of surveying people in the force area in order to obtain their views on the annual police budget and their perception about the police and victim services. My communications and engagement team are making significant efforts to reach out to communities who have been traditionally under-represented in such polling such as younger people and those of a black and minority ethnic background. As an example, we have reached out to the Devon and

Cornwall South Asian Society which has agreed to distribute a link to the survey in its newsletter and feature it at their annual event. An Easy Read survey is being created to circulate to our learning disabled communities.

I have a role in monitoring how the police handle and respond to complaints about Devon and Cornwall Police, its officers and operational police staff. Under police complaint reforms, from 1 February 2020, the Police and Crime Commissioner is the 'appropriate authority' to review certain police complaints where a complainant is dissatisfied with the outcome. The Police and Crime Commissioner is also responsible for appointing and providing Legally Qualified Chairs and Independent Misconduct Hearing Panel members for Police Misconduct Hearings. More details are available on <https://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk/about-us/complaints/complaints-against-devon-and-cornwall-police-officers/>

### **How can the Torbay's community get involved?**

As part of the range of ways my office seeks the views of communities, we have developed mechanisms for individuals to share their lived experience with us, this may be as a victim of crime, an offender or through other contacts with the criminal justice system. These volunteers help us develop policy, contribute their views and influence our decision making.

It is vital that public bodies better understand the barriers to service that people of diverse backgrounds experience and make a greater effort to understand the cultural differences that can lead to mistrust and poor communication. Along with diverse communities understanding how to use their voice and what they can do to change the concerns of disproportionality within the policing and crime realm. Meaningful engagement is part of this solution.

Lack of confidence in policing and criminal justice systems is often a barrier for some communities in engaging and taking forward key issues with authorities. There are a variety of ways on which communities which lack this confidence can safely link with policing and my office. For example:

- If you do not feel comfortable contacting the police, there are a variety of third-party reporting services you can use such as Stop Hate UK (0800 138 1625) and Crimestoppers (0800 555 111) which can be done anonymously
- Victims of crime can seek support from the 24/7 Victim Support Webchat <https://www.victimcaredevonandcornwall.org.uk/victimsupportwebchat/> or contact the Victim Care Unit directly
- Visit a Blue Light Day if they have disabilities
- Volunteer as an Independent Custody Visitor
- Volunteer to provide lived experience insight to our policies and practices
- Volunteer to join one of the OPCC Scrutiny Panels

There are also now more than 300 Councillor Advocates working with the OPCC across Devon and Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly. Councillor Advocates are local elected representatives from any party and any level of council (from parish councillors to county and district councillors) who work with the OPCC and link their local community with policing.

For more information about how the scheme runs and how to become a member visit <https://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk/take-part/councillor-advocate-scheme/>.

Both the force and my office will be supporting diversity events either digitally or physically in the year ahead and the council might like to explore options to collaborate on these projects.

## **Sending the right message to our communities and our people**

It is right that organisations across the private and public spheres unite in their message that racism will not be tolerated. Opportunities to speak loudly and publicly on this subject, such as Hate Crime Awareness Week, should be utilised not only in external communications but also to reassure employees that they are part of an inclusive organisation that values and respects difference.

A recent video produced by the OPCC to mark Hate Crime Awareness Week centred on the lived experiences of minority hate crime victims in Devon and Cornwall and was among the most viewed and engaging pieces of content the office has produced. It can be viewed at <https://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk/news-and-blog/multimedia-hub/why-it's-more-important-than-ever-to-call-out-hatred-in-our-communities/>

This video showed the arson attack on the synagogue in Exeter last year of which the Chief Rabbi of the UK stated that our force was an example for the rest of the country in how it dealt with it. Along with receiving a Highly Commended World Class Policing Award in competition with international police forces.

I also make myself personally accessible and available to anyone in our community that feels either my office or the force is not getting things right. Recently I have been working alongside diverse communities in Plymouth to help rebuild trust and have funded them to help form a coalition to tackle hate and discrimination.

### **The next steps**

There remain challenges ahead for the police force and for my office in relation to this issue. In the next six months my office has committed to:

- Providing quality assurance to our policies and Equality Impact Assessments and identify any areas of improvement.
- Developing an approach for virtual engagement with diverse communities during the COVID pandemic when face-to-face engagement has not been possible.
- Recruiting two independent and diverse members with lived experience to participate on the Domestic Abuse Perpetrator Interventions Project Board.
- Improving office understanding of equality and diversity and the factors that contribute to disparity.

I have also offered express support to the seven recommendations from the Black and Minority Ethnic Steering Group established in Cornwall as part of my role on the Cornwall and Isles of Scilly Leadership Board led by the Council. You may find these recommendations of interest and they can be found here:

<https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s138403/Tackling%20racism%20and%20inequalities%20for%20ethnic%20minority%20residents%20in%20Cornwall%20and%20the%20Isles%20of%20Scilly%20V.pdf>

I hope that my submission offers some reassurance to our community and look forward to hearing about your discussions and suggestions from today.

Please do not hesitate to contact my office for further information or assistance.



## Getting in Touch

You can contact us the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner using following methods:

**Telephone:** 01392 225555.

**Email:** [opcc@devonandcornwall.pnn.police.uk](mailto:opcc@devonandcornwall.pnn.police.uk)

### Post:

The Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner

Andy Hocking House

Alderson Drive

Exeter EX2 7RP

**Attending a public engagement event or forum:** you can find details about our public engagement events, forums and public meetings

**Follow us on Social media:** follow our official social media accounts on [Facebook](#), [Twitter](#) and [Instagram](#)

**Website:** [www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk](http://www.devonandcornwall-pcc.gov.uk) – for access to information

## Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service 8 December 2020

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Darling, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Councillor Brooks, Councillor Chris Lewis, Councillor Barbara Lewis, Councillor Morey, Councillor Douglas-Dunbar, Councillor Law, Audrey Gilding-de Kort (Diversity & Inclusion Manager, DSFRS), Emma Wilshaw (Diversity and Inclusion Officer, DSFRS), Yaz Murfin (Chair of the Multicultural Staff Support Network, DSFRS), Wayne Rawlins (Area Manager Risk Management- Operational Risk, Prevention and Protection, DSFRS) and Ryan Houghton (Policy Procedure and Guidance Officer, DSFRS).**

The key responses from Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service (DSFRS) representatives are detailed below:

- That DSFRS had undertaken work with the Eastern European community and found that a significant issue was the language barrier for this community to engage and understand key messages from the Fire Service such as what to do in a fire and who to call (it was stated that only one third of the Polish population knew to phone 999 in case of fire). DSFRS found that the best way to engage and communicate with this community was to do it via 'community gatekeepers' who the community trusted
- DSFRS are now very aware of the issue of language and that many in their community do not have English as their first language or have little or no English language skills and the Fire Service now they are working on a multi-language website
- DSFRS stated that they had no evidence of racial abuse of their staff but that they did have a recording process in place to capture this data if it took place

- DSFRS explained that in terms of recruiting for staff they previously just used local postcodes as a restriction but now they have removed this restriction to encourage staff recruitment from as wide a range of areas as possible
- DSFRS also explained that they had dropped the need for formal qualifications from their recruitment process and that instead they tested candidates to see if they met their thresholds – the reason for doing this was that they wanted to encourage candidates who may have qualifications from other countries who would find it problematic to apply with qualifications from their country of origin
- DSFRS uses relocation packages for some jobs to attract candidates from outside Devon and Somerset
- DSFRS explained that they were aware that the BAME community were under-represented in their workforce and that there were a number of barriers to recruiting BAME staff and these were:
  - Because of austerity and cuts their recruitment has been piecemeal and this has made it difficult to mount a high profile campaign to attract BAME candidates
  - In relation to firefighters the need for some to live 5 minutes from their fire station was a challenge as many of the stations are in rural locations where the BAME community is poorly represented
  - There is a lack of BAME role models in the Fire Service both locally and nationally
  - Perception in community that only role in Fire Service is being a firefighter and therefore more needs to be done to promote the wider set of roles in the service and the career progression within the service to the BAME community
- DSFRS recognised that they need to do more to engage with the BAME community in Devon and Somerset but that previous attempts had been difficult and disappointing as it was really hard to reach and speak to many sections of the BAME community. However, DSFRS is establishing a project with some of their stations to encourage them to regularly meet with their local communities but this has been temporarily paused due to the pressures of the COVID-19 pandemic
- DSFRS explained that the London Fire Brigade had started to use ‘Culture cards’ to enable firefighters to have the skills to engage with the BAME community
- DSFRS stated that the significant part of their interaction with the BAME community was in relation to compliance and enforcement activity on businesses in the hospitality sector and that in Torbay they worked with the council on a scheme known as ‘Better Business for All’ which sought to support BAME businesses to comply with fire and environmental health laws. However, DSFRS admitted that they needed to do more on this area and take a position of supporting and educating business owners rather than just enforcing the rules
- DSFRS explained that retaining their staff was also important as once you have attracted candidates to the Fire Service you need to ensure you retain them by making support available. To facilitate this the Fire Service has established a Multicultural Staff Support Network which is undertaking support and activities such as promoting Black History Month within the Service
- DSFRS stated that they are looking to improve their recruitment of BAME staff by better utilising social media and advertising in locations where BAME people were more likely to see the advert such as Asian or Eastern European food supermarkets



- DSFRS explained that they did not have recruitment targets in relation to BAME staff as they want their staff to be appointed on merit
- In conclusion DSFRS identified a number of areas where it could do better on BAME issues and these are:
  - Identify and gain the trust of and work with the ‘community gatekeepers’ in the BAME communities
  - Get better at collecting data on the BAME community so services can be adapted and shaped to meet the needs of the BAME community
  - Continue to support the existing BAME staff via the staff network but look at others way to support BAME staff
  - Develop key performance measures and indicators on BAME issues so the DSFRS can see how it is doing on this issue and address any poor performance
  - Continue to constantly explore different ways to attract BAME candidates to the Fire Service in Devon and Somerset such as BAME open days and challenging old recruitment methods such as word of mouth in rural areas

The following actions were identified by the panel:

- Review Panel to consider visiting a Torbay fire station when safe to do so to promote BAME issues.

## Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust 21 January 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla, Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Darling, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Councillor Barbara Lewis, Councillor Chris Lewis, Councillor Bye, Councillor Hill, Councillor Long, Councillor Mandy Darling, Councillor Brooks, Councillor Foster, Liz Davenport (Chief Executive, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust), Sir Richard Ibbotson (Chairman, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust), Sanita Simadree (Chair of Devon BAME Network, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust).**

The chair explained that the review was being renamed as the Torbay Racism Review after listening to feedback from the local community.

The key responses from the Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust service representatives are detailed below:

- That the Trust is working closely with South Devon College to build career pathways for those that cannot learn in traditional ways to access healthcare roles and that being an ICO offers wider opportunity to staff but that more could be done to listen to the views of the BAME community and BAME staff to see if this approach is working. The trust were keen to stress that career opportunities were not just clinical but also for support staff
- That the Trust has approximately 6,000 employees and that of this 6% are from a BAME background, however the Trust recognises it still needs to do more to be an organisation that is reflective of its local community

- The Trust recognises that it has a strong track record of recruiting BAME staff from outside of Torbay but needs to get better at recruiting BAME staff from within Torbay
- The Trust is keen to work more closely with local schools on recruiting staff for their organisation
- The Trust recognises that it needs to continually improve its engagement with the BAME community and that the best way to do this was through gaining the trust of community leaders who already have the trust and relationship with their community. The Trust is especially keen to work with the council on addressing this
- The Trust recognises the need to educate staff on BAME issues and cultural diversity as the staff community are embedded in the local community and are the organisations' best ambassadors
- The Trust would like to explore using BAME role models in their organisation to promote the recruitment of BAME staff but they also see the importance of Torbay being a vibrant community in attracting BAME staff to move here from other areas
- The Trust have invested time and resources in ensuring BAME staff especially from overseas have strong pastoral support and this has helped to retain and recruit BAME staff
- The Trust has strong communication routes and resources to communicate with BAME patients and adheres to national NHS standards but is not complacent on this and is always looking to improve its communication with BAME patients but sees the best way of doing this as working with the local BAME community on what works best for them
- One challenge that the Trust is facing is assessing the qualifications from overseas workers to ensure they have the appropriate skills and knowledge to work in the NHS
- The Trust also faces a challenge in meeting the cultural requirements of BAME patients whilst juggling its finite resources and this was especially relevant to the provision of mixed sex wards
- Whilst the Trust adheres to all the relevant equality and diversity legislation and standards it does recognise that its Board of Executives and non-executives is not representative of the community it serves and is seeking to redress this via reverse mentoring by senior staff being mentored by other Trust staff
- One of the ways the Trust is seeking to improve its understanding of BAME issues is by supporting the Devon BAME Network
- The Trust was clear that its approach to recruitment is based on merit and not a quota approach
- The Trust has recognised the higher mortality rate of the BAME community and has a rigorous risk assessment process in place to protect staff including those from a BAME background
- The Trust uses a variety of methods to engage with its staff to ensure they are culturally equipped to work with the BAME community, this includes the Devon Network, review of data, staff survey, Freedom to Speak up Guardians and exit interviews but it does recognise that it could undertake more cultural diversity training with its workforce and is developing cultural competency frameworks to address this. However, these frameworks need to be co-designed with BAME staff and BAME patients

- The Trust does recognise however that BAME staff and patients are more reticent to complain or raise issues or concerns so they need to do more to build trust so that people feel comfortable in coming forward
- The Trust stated that abuse of BAME workers was still higher than for non-BAME workers but that this was slowly reducing, however the Trust has a zero tolerance policy in relation to abuse and rigorously enforces it
- The Trust is working closely with the Council on recruitment and retention of staff but that if more was done around key worker housing, creation of a vibrant community and social connections the recruitment and retention of staff especially from a BAME background would be improved
- The Trust explained that they have a dedicated and discrete service to work with overseas patients who require medical support in Torbay
- One area of BAME staff that the Trust recognised as requiring more support was care home workers and they wanted to work jointly with the council on addressing this issue
- The Trust explained that they feel that the establishment of the Devon NHS BAME Network has been helpful in allowing BAME staff to share their experiences and for themes and issues to be identified and addressed – but they would like to do more on this and would particularly like to work jointly with the council on developing this network as the network is run by volunteers
- Overall the Trust sees its strength is in the pastoral care it gives to BAME staff but it recognises it needs to do more such as
  - See past the NHS targets and performance indicators to ensure it is an authentic organisation that values staff and its patients irrespective of their background
  - Engage and work more closely with the local BAME community so that trust is built and communication is two way
  - Improve the equality of career aspirations amongst BAME staff
  - Ensure Board is linked in to the experience of BAME patients and staff

## Torbay Housing Providers 3 August 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor John Thomas (Chair), Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Hayley Austin: Director of Housing, Westward. Julie Bingham: Regional Manager Neighbourhoods, Live West.**

Julie Bingham and then Hayley Austin presented information about their organisations in response to the question plan submitted by the panel. The panel members then directed a number of questions based around the key question of how do we make Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) lives matter at Torbay's public organisations?

The key aspects from the Live West presentation are detailed below:

- Live West employs 1417 employees. Their goal is 2.5% BAME staff in Senior Management roles and 10% BAME representation on their non-executive board. Currently there are 0% for both but this is a recognised concern for the organisation and work is being done to

promote roles and develop careers. 2.1% of Management and Team Leaders are from a BAME background.

- Live West work closely with the SARI (Stand Against Racial Inequality) company based in Bristol. Live West funds SARI to carry out individual case work. SARI also acts as a critical friend offering advice to the organisation. Live West's Board, Executive and Operational teams have all received training from SARI.
- Live West have re-introduced Equality Risk Assessments for their new and existing policies and procedures and all policies will reference Equality and Diversity. The Anti-Social Behaviour and Hate Crime Policy outlines that Hate Incidents are responded to by Live West within 24 hours and SARI are involved in offering support to victims of hate Incidents. If a person believes they are the victim of a Hate Incident, it is categorised as such in Live West's records.
- Live West had an increase in reported Hate Incidents from 2019 to 2020 and during the period of COVID-19 lockdown. This increase was also seen by other Housing Providers. It was recognised that there were probably further incidents which were not reported and there is more that could be done across the sector to identify the underlying themes of ASB incidents.
- The Equality Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Board at Live West have changed the way they work to become more effective, better at challenging, to make faster changes to support communities and teams with issues around EDI, and identify areas where they could do better. Each member is a decision maker from a different area of the organisation who takes responsibility for actions and reports back to the board. A number of action plans have been developed to break down, monitor and deal with their identified challenges.
- An ambitious new strategy based around six pillars; Growth, Accessibility, Belong, Individuality, Trust and Challenge, has been developed by the EDI board and is in the final stages before being adopted. As part of the strategy, Live West are promoting the work they are doing to improve Hate Crime reporting on their website.
- Equality Diversity and Inclusivity is listed among Live West's 2021/22 Key Strategic Priorities which highlights the importance of the work of the EDI board and its outcomes.
- Live West have launched diversity groups to reach out to customers and staff and take an active role in promoting Equality and Diversity. One of these groups, the Race and Ethnicity Equality Network (REEN), support the organisation by challenging them with issues around racial equality and fairness and share stories and experiences to help make positive changes to working practices. The group attend EDI board meetings and are currently working to help Live West support underrepresented communities.
- Live West works to retain BAME staff in a number of ways including promoting apprenticeships to BAME communities, encouraging diversity in the workplace, supporting individuals with personal development and wellbeing and providing inclusive facilities i.e. prayer rooms.
- Live West received a small number of complaints connected to unconscious bias, often connected to how they have dealt with bias from neighbours. Live West ensure they take a zero-tolerance approach to hate incidents, taking steps to educate customers and involving SARI to improve relationships between neighbours. Cases are reviewed for learning and improvement opportunities and outcomes shared with colleagues.

- There are various policies at Live West to support staff in reporting Hate Crimes including those for grievances and unacceptable behaviour from customers. Reports are logged via the Assure Portal and investigated by an assigned manager.
- Live West take the opportunity to learn from other groups such as SARI, the Race Equality Strategic Leaders' Group and the Race Equality Covid-19 Steering Group to improve their support to BAME customers and staff.

The key aspects from the Westward Housing presentation are detailed below:

- The impact of the Black Lives Matter movement has brought race inequality to the fore prompted the sector to consider its role in addressing the issue.
- The report from the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities has been criticised by the sector as it acknowledged inequalities in housing but did not explore the issue.
- The trade magazine – Inside Housing, are running a series of monthly articles on racism and housing to explore the impact on communities.
- The National Housing Federation review report on Housing Association staff and webinar on tackling discrimination and fostering inclusion within communities was recommended to the panel.
- Westward carry out mandatory training for staff on Equality and Diversity and on safeguarding (including modern slavery) to ensure their staff are equipped to work with all communities. There is also a wealth of information and support on their intranet under the banner of equality. Staff are also supported by policies, networks and local agencies and both individually in 1 to 1s and in team meetings.
- Westward are in the process of completing their Equality Statement and Equality Policy. The statement sets out what Westward will do as an organisation to work towards addressing discrimination and the promotion of inequality. It is reviewed by the board annually and monitored twice a year by the Executive Team.
- Westward also carry out an LGA Social Housing Equality Framework self-assessment which is an equality performance measurement tool.
- The broad policy framework at Westward also includes Equality Impact Assessments, Hate Crime, ASB and whistleblowing policies.
- Westward promote awareness events and campaigns e.g., Black History Month, their Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement, National Hate Crime Awareness Week and the Torbay Racism Review Panel.
- Westward recognises its Vision, values and workplace culture as well as its policy framework are its strengths in working with Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Communities. There was recognition that the sector does not have representation at senior level, equality and diversity work is being done in isolation and the sector could improve its equality data and benchmarking to learn where the gaps are to help spot trends.
- Westward have been keen to develop links to gain knowledge and improve how they work with communities. One way they have been doing this is their Community Involvement Officer has been attending the Torbay Racism Review Panel meetings.
- Westward doesn't currently record if complaints are made by people with BAME backgrounds but uses a variety of methods to review customer feedback and learn from it.

- At Westward 2.8% of the workforce are from Black, Asian or Minority Ethnic backgrounds. At senior there is a positive gender balance but no representation from the Black, Asian or Minority Ethnic population. It recognises that strong values are not enough to ensure a diverse workforce.
- Westward would like to do more to understand how many people from BAME backgrounds are applying for jobs and look at shared data from the sector.
- Westward works to retain staff by striving to be a desirable place to work in terms of pay and conditions and maintains a focus on staff wellbeing. Feedback from independent exit interviews is used as a learning opportunity.
- Staff can report incidences of racism in 1 to 1s. Equality and Diversity training and the Bullying and Harassment Policy support the process of dealing with reports.
- Westward would like to work with other Housing Providers in the Torbay area to share data, experiences and good practice in order to support customers from BAME backgrounds.
- Key responses to Panel questions by Live West and Westward Housing are detailed below:
  - Live West engaged the REEN group to develop their Equality Strategy and help them understand BAME communities, their history and what's important to them.
  - Westward carry out customer journey mapping to learn from customers to inform policies. The organisation's Hate Crime policy is being reviewed so members of BAME communities will be asked to feedback on what they'd like to see included.
  - Both Housing providers expressed the importance of carrying out visits to customers to engage with them and support those who do not have access to technology. It is also important that the operatives going out into the community have awareness training to help identify areas of safeguarding concern for customers e.g., Domestic Abuse and Hate Crimes. There remains a challenge in effectively consulting with groups without using technology.
  - Both Housing Providers are committed to ensuring messages on equality are promoted throughout the year and not just for Black History Month.
  - It was suggested that the panel look at the problem of the private rented sector in terms of security of tenure and overcrowding and review the housing waiting list in terms of demographics.
  - Live West have experienced issues in obtaining land in the South West to build affordable homes due to increasing competition from developers. It has also been difficult to find accommodation for tenants who have had to leave their homes due to fire or flood because of the lack of available properties and hotel rooms as a result of an increase in holiday makers.
  - Housing Associations have been subject to a regulation rent reduction by the government for the last four years. They have recently been allowed to raise rents by Consumer Price Index +1%. This reduction in income has impacted on the amount of new affordable homes being built by Housing Associations.
  - A Housing Associations response to reports of ASB is in collaboration between multiple agencies. The resources of all agencies have been stretched by their response to the pandemic and Housing Associations are finding themselves dealing with new issues such

as county lines and cuckooing. The periods of isolation during the pandemic have resulted in more reports of ASB which are actually neighbour disputes, for which their available response is often limited to offering coaching and mediation to mend relationships.

Information requested by the panel:

- Contact information for the REEN Group – Supplied.
- A link to the National Housing Federation Webinar: Tackling discrimination and fostering inclusion within communities – Supplied.
- Copies of Inside Housing Magazine – Link to article supplied.
- When available: Data on how many properties had been allocated to people with BAME backgrounds during the pandemic.

## NHS Devon Clinical Commissioning Group 18 August 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Steve Darling, Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Jane Milligan, CEO Devon CCG and Integrated Care System (ICS) for Devon, Andrew Millward, Director of Communications and Engagement of ICS Devon; and Director of Communications, HR and IT, Devon CCG, Nellie Guttmann, Senior Strategic Engagement Manager, Devon CCG and Lincoln Sargeant, Director of Public Health, Torbay Council and Chair of Devon Health Inequalities Executive.**

1. Presentation of Nous Report on Experiences of Health and Care in Devon for BAME Communities and Staff

The CCG representatives gave a presentation on the outcomes and recommendations made in the Nous report. The work to inform the report was undertaken in September 2020-April 2021 by NHS and Local Authority organisations in Devon and sought to review the experiences of the diverse communities and staff across Devon, including Torbay.

The report made 34 recommendations and these will inform the equality, diversity and inclusion strategy for the new Integrated Care System (ICS).

In relation to staff feedback the main themes of the report were:

- Concerns from BAME staff about recruitment, progression and ethnic diversity in their organisation
- Staff experiences of racism, which though rare do occur and are not always dealt with effectively by their organisation
- Staff view that equality and diversity is not a priority for their organisation
- Staff concerns about a lack of BAME staff networks and their sustainability.

In relation to community feedback the main themes of the report were:

- Inadequate interpretation and translation support which causes barriers
- Perceived lack of cultural competence among providers

- Concerns about mental health and isolation due to challenges in accessing services.

In essence the 34 recommendations focus on:

- Developing community reference group/s to represent the views of diverse communities across Devon
- Supporting the development of the system BAME staff network
- Co-designing and delivering cultural awareness training for staff in all organisations across the ICS
- Co-designing services including translation and interpretation
- Overhauling recruitment and progression to build a more diverse workforce that represents local ethnic minority communities across the ICS in Devon
- Building stronger relationships with communities to ensure health services meet the needs of people from ethnic minority communities

The CCG explained that progress is already being made by the ICS on the issues identified in the report by:

- Increasing support and collaboration with the BAME staff network
- Working to ensure Devon is a welcoming place to work for international nurses and medics
- Working to widen BAME representation via the voluntary and community sector
- Ensuring the recruitment process for ICS Devon chair is undertaken with representation from diverse communities
- Using Nous findings to inform the Covid vaccination outreach programme approach.

## 2. How do we make Black, Asian and Minority ethnic lives matter at Torbay's Public organisations – Questions to Devon CCG

The CCG representatives gave an overview of the organisation and made the following points in relation to the key question:

- CCG employs around 450 staff, around 100 are based in Torbay (Pomona House)
- BAME staff make up approximately 2.2% of the CCG's staff population
- Although unacceptably low, the number of ethnic minority staff within the CCG has been increasing over the past few years. For example, some departments in the organisation are improving more quickly (Comms, HR and IT is currently at 5.4%)
- There is a CCG Objective (measured at Board level) to move this closer to the Devon average of 6.4%
- CCG has been overseeing the vaccination programme. Through the outreach of this work, they are starting to build strong links with ethnic minority communities. Examples include:
  - Working with the Muslim community to deliver a vaccination pop up site at the Exeter Mosque



- Working with Devon and Cornwall Chinese Association to vaccinate migrant workers and undocumented migrants
  - Vaccine ambassadors programme – Diverse Health and Social Care staff have been acting as champions to support the vaccine programme.
  - Facilitating question and answer sessions with community groups, including Christian Fellowship churches
  - A new Equality Diversity and Inclusion Group has been set up and linked to the Staff Partnership Forum to oversee the organisation's cultural development programme and the overhaul of recruitment
- Panel members and others then asked a series of questions and the main points in relation to the responses from the CCG are detailed below:
  - The ICS network will provide greater opportunities for staff, especially BAME staff to develop and gather greater experience and promotion across the network of ICS organisations
  - Organisations in the ICS needed to see the appraisal process as less of a tick box exercise and more of an opportunity to develop staff, especially BAME staff
  - More reverse mentoring is required across the ICS organisations to ensure BAME staff have the opportunities to grow and that senior leaders understand the issues facing their BAME staff
  - More is required to be done to attract BAME people to work in Devon and that one of the key barriers is appropriate and affordable accommodation
  - Tensions were identified between international recruitment of staff and de-skilling the workforce in their country of origin. However, more could be done to build partnerships with other countries to develop workforces that are beneficial to both countries
  - Although international recruitment is helpful, there is still a huge untapped potential workforce from the UK, especially from a BAME background that could be utilised
  - Data collection on racism in the NHS could be better and is stopping it from understanding the issues facing BAME staff and communities. One response to this would be peer challenge on equality and diversity issues from organisations within the ICS
  - That whilst there are pockets of good practice across Devon, more needs to be done to tackle the disproportionate impact of mental health on BAME communities as a result of the Covid pandemic. This requires greater investment in cultural sensitivity training for key staff so people are encouraged to engage with services and are not put off. Essentially organisations need to build trust with their BAME communities so that they feel confident to access services
  - That cultural sensitivity training for ICS staff in Torbay was still in the process of being planned but would be implemented soon
  - That the CCG had plans in place to deal with the impending arrival of refugees from Afghanistan who will require support from the NHS
  - The CCG was confident that during the Covid pandemic NHS organisations in Devon had undertaken robust risk assessments of all staff (including staff from a BAME background) to protect them from infection

- Overall the CGG and ICS organisations are confident that they will achieve successful outcomes in relation to the 34 recommendations outlined in the Nous report and have invested more resources to deliver these actions. However, there is recognition that some would take longer to achieve than others. An action plan has been created to manage the recommendations but the future is more about embedding a new way of working rather than mechanically ticking off actions.

## South Devon College 8 November 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Douglas-Dunbar (substitute for Councillor Steve Darling), Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.**

**Also Present: Laurence Frewin, Principal and CEO, South Devon College, Liz Lawrence, Assistant Principal, South Devon College and Kelly Sooben, Vice-Principal, South Devon College, Councillor Law**

The panel asked a range of questions to the representatives from South Devon College and the key points that came out of the questioning were:

- The college supports BAME students via its tutorial system and via a personal development programme which focuses on citizenship and equality and diversity. The college also does a lot to promote Black History Month, has an International Club, a country of the week and a focus on current affairs issues. The college did a lot on the Black Lives Matter issue and celebrates events such as Diwali at the College and offers cultural trips for students.
- The college has an Equality Working Group that focuses on all protected characteristics and meets regularly to review the experiences of BAME learners but the college does acknowledge that it could do more
- The college measures the success of these initiatives via the student voice and listens to students. The Senior Leadership Team meets once a month to review equality and diversity issues and to identify issues and gaps. In relation to staff that leave, exit interviews are held to determine any issues and the same is done with learners who leave South Devon College
- The college has a buoyant take up from adult students who have English as a second language
- The panel questioned whether students felt safe to voice concerns on race issues. The college explained that they have a system in place that allows students to raise issues anonymously or they can raise issues via the tutorial system with their tutor. Other mechanisms are also available such as student councils and specific groups such as young carers
- Staff can voice concerns via the robust policies in place via their manager or HR team and the college regularly reviews these policies to ensure they are best practice
- The college stated that in relation to race the culture of the college was explicit. This was backed up by its statement in response to George Floyd's death in May 2020
- The panel asked about racist incidents at the college and the college stated that they were not seeing high levels of reporting but they are aware that there could be underreporting of

incidents. However, the college did state that over the last 12 months they had no racist incidents with staff

- The panel questioned whether the college had measurable objectives on racial equality and they responded by stating that they had more work to do on this and that it was still work in progress. They explained that they wanted to do more work with BAME staff and learners to explore what the right actions and measures could be
- A member of the public asked the college what work they did with families of learners to address racism. The college stated that they already did lots of general work with parents and families but often found it difficult to engage with them and that they could do more to engage with BAME families specifically to support them and their children
- The college explained that all new staff have mandatory equality and diversity training when they arrive at the college and then all staff have annual updates to keep them up to speed on best practice in this area. In addition, some staff such as those involved in the Prevent Agenda have specialist training
- The college considers that their strengths in relation to equality and diversity are listening to their learners, the strengths of the personal development programme, clear code of conduct for staff, robust Equality Impact Assessment process and low instances of racist incidents with staff
- The college considers its areas for development in equality and diversity to be; improved data tracking, better engagement with the local community to check they have the right actions in place, improving reporting processes to encourage learners and staff to report incidents, to increase number of BAME staff and learners, to work more closely with families and parents on equality and diversity, to work more closely with staff to find ways to remove or overcome barriers, to encourage BAME staff to come and work at the college and to highlight existing staff who can be role models for others
- The panel questioned whether a formal process for raising incidents for staff and learners was appropriate and whether informal processes also played a role. The college explained that all incidents start off informally and then, as appropriate, scale up to the formal process if required. The important thing the college wanted to express though, was that all racist incidents at the college would be treated seriously
- The panel questioned how quickly the college could implement improved reporting of incidents and the college responded by stating that the personal development programme for learners could be revised in two weeks to focus on any changes required
- The college stated that they were very keen to work collaboratively with other organisations in Torbay but especially those in the public sector, to have a joint approach to tackling racism and other aspects of equality and diversity. The college was particularly keen to learn from other organisations on how to improve reporting of incidents
- A member of the public suggested that the college look at using theatre to raise the issue of racism with their students and inspire conversation about it
- In response to a question from the panel the college stated that the council could help them on this issue by removing some of the barriers to BAME staff and learners moving to Torbay via improved housing, more jobs and making the culture and environment of Torbay more welcoming to people from a BAME background. They also wanted to collaborate more closely with the council as they recognise this is not just a college issue but is so

across Torbay's organisations and institutions. The college was keen that a community wealth building approach was taken to tackling the issue.

- Action – College to provide racist incident figures to panel Action – College to share any adjustments made to personal development programme with panel

## National Black Police Association 17 November 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Law (substitute for Councillor Steve Darling) and Councillor John Thomas (Vice Chair).**

**Also Present: Inspector Andrew George, President of the National Black Police Association (NBPA) and Inspector Yvan Clarke, the Local National Black Police Association Chair, Devon and Cornwall Police BAME staff network, Councillor Barbara Lewis, Councillor Chris Lewis and Councillor Brooks.**

The panel asked a range of questions to the representatives from the National Black Police Association and the key points that came out of the questioning were:

- It was explained that the NBPA was founded in 1998 and had started as informal networks in the Metropolitan Police but that the association has now developed to be present in nearly all police forces in the UK
- It was explained that there is still a wide disparity in representation of BAME police officers in the UK, this roughly equates to 93% white officers to 7% BAME officers – the NBPA explained that the national recruitment drive to appoint 20,000 officers was helping to increase this number but that the increases were only minimal, and this was also being impacted on by BAME officers leaving the force (generally between their first to fourth year of employment) - the NBPA offers advice and support to senior officers leading the recruitment drive
- The NBPA explained that BAME officers often in their experience feel they need to fit into the white dominated forces they work for, rather than maintain their cultural identity and often poor retainment of BAME officers is down to them feeling isolated and unsupported by their force
- One issue highlighted on BAME officer recruitment was that of candidates needing a C grade at GCSE English and that this was a barrier to candidates who are educated overseas – the NPBA was currently in the process of lobbying the Home Office on this issue
- The NBPA also explained that another barrier to recruitment was that BAME candidates often do not come from social networks where entering the police force is accepted as a career option and thus at times they struggle at interviews and test centres
- The NBPA stated that BAME representation was still very low at senior officer grades
- It was explained that there was a perception that BAME officers recruited only got in the force as there is a need to increase BAME officer numbers rather than on the quality of candidates
- The NBPA explained that BAME officers are twice as likely to face misconduct charges than a white officer and that more independence in this process was required to manage

this issue - however it was explained that this statistic was only based on new data and that more work had to be done to understand this issue

- One issue raised by the NBPA was that some police forces do not include the NBPA in the induction process for new officers and that this stops the NBPA supporting those officers
- The NBPA explained that to tackle racism in the police force we need to move away from the 'them and us' model and develop empathy for race as a protected characteristic rather than what normally emerges which is hostility, the police needs to recognise the concept of institutional racism and use it as a vehicle to discuss and take action – however the biggest thing that the police and society needs to do is bring people who are different together more often so that they communicate and socialise and understand each other more, this is especially needed in areas such as Devon where the BAME population is so small that local understanding of race is also low
- The NBPA stated that police forces needed to do more to engage and collaborate with the BAME community but that it was not good enough to parachute in and then parachute out – the engagement needed to be sustained and meaningful
- In terms of improving recruitment for BAME officers the NBPA stated that they wanted to see more sustained engagement with BAME communities to build trust in the police, so it was seen as a career option, they also want to see BAME officers more involved in designing recruitment processes as at present this design process is dominated by white officers
- The NBPA stated that at present no police force in the UK is representative of the community they serve
- When asked what the council could do to help the NBPA explained that it wanted to see the wider public sector come out of its silos and work together on the issues related to race such as joint recruitment events – they also wanted the council to hold the relevant Police and Crime Commissioners to account on this issue
- It was explained that in the Devon and Cornwall police force there was currently a BAME staff network that was seeking to link with the NBPA
- Devon and Cornwall Police are acting on race issues in the police and have 10 strategic objectives on race - it was explained that the force is seeking to increase cultural awareness in its senior officers and is also undertaking a Cultural Audit via an external body which is due to report in mid 2022 with recommendations
- The NBPA explained that it would like to see more engagement with BAME young people to break down the barriers of joining the police as at times this can go against the cultural values of some BAME communities
- When asked where racist incident happen most for BAME officers it was explained that it was often alcohol related incidents or in custody suites, but that BAME police officers faced micro aggression daily from the public and from colleagues – it was explained that tacking racism from colleagues was particularly difficult as it made you stand out
- The NBPA stated that Devon and Cornwall Police is always an area of concern in relation to stop and search disparity figures when they are released each year

## Devon Partnership Trust 6 December 2021

**Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Barrant, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Steve Darling and Councillor John Thomas (Vice Chair), Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo.**

**Also Present: Melanie Walker: CEO, Devon Partnership NHS Trust, Andy Willis: Chair, Devon Partnership NHS Trust, Laura Hobbs: Director of Corporate Affairs, Devon Partnership NHS Trust, Councillor David Thomas, Councillor Chris Lewis, Councillor Foster and Councillor Pentney.**

The panel asked a range of questions to the representatives from Devon Partnership NHS Trust (DPT) and the key points that came out of the questioning were:

- Devon Partnership Trust (DPT) is a mental health and learning disability trust providing a wide range of NHS services to people with mental health and learning disability needs - in Devon, the wider South West region and nationally. The Trust also commissions regional secure services as lead provider within the South West Provider Collaborative.
- DPT employs around 4,000 full time equivalent staff. The vision of the organisation is to build an inclusive society where the importance of mental health and wellbeing is universally understood and valued.
- The DPT board has recently approved a new Trust Strategy for the next three years, of which one of the key objectives is to promote social justice and inclusion in the widest sense for all communities served by DPT, including Torbay and to tackle discrimination. The aim is to foster a culture where patients and staff feel able to be themselves and bring their whole selves to their care, treatment and employment.
- DPT make it clear that they value diversity of experience as well as background which helps to make an impact upon the mental health and well-being of their patients but also their staff and wider society. They are clear they have more to do to ensure staff and patients get the support and services they need in a holistic and personalised way but summarised how huge progress is already being made.
- The Director of Corporate Affairs for DPT provides executive leadership on equality, diversity and inclusion. Part of that role is to ensure all organisational policies, procedures and strategies maintain a focus on all aspects of equality and inclusion and how those aspects are potentially impacted.
- A higher than average proportion of the Devon population of senior doctors from Black or Asian or Minority Ethnic groups (BAME) are employed at DPT but not in other senior roles. This is being addressed by looking at how support can be given to make sure BAME employees have equal opportunities to progress through career pathways and wider targeted recruitment at people from diverse ethnic backgrounds.
- The Trust uses a combination of locally collected and wider Devon census data to ascertain the representation of their service users. They stated they don't appear to have to have an overrepresentation of people from BAME groups using their services, but numbers are very small and need to be considered carefully. In partnership with Public Health and other organisations, DPT is making sure people can access their services and are working with different community groups and networks to help them find the best ways to reach people.
- DPT works to ensure people feel that they are being seen and treated as an individual and that their cultural needs are recognised through all aspects of care and treatment.

- DPT has set up and is running a range of staff networks, one of which is for BAME staff, so there is a place where they can come together and discuss experiences and provide peer support to each other. This is also a forum for the network to invite senior leaders to discussions about what else could be done within the organisation, what would make a difference, what's not going well and how any issues can be resolved.
- DPT has done work with its Secure Services around Black men's mental health, and is working in partnership with Black men who use their services or have used similar services elsewhere to help design them. This is to ensure their voices are heard and understood in how services are designed and delivered. DPT's Secure Services were part of a national pilot addressing health inequalities for Black men in care services across the country.
- The Chaplaincy Service at DPT has been reviewed to ensure there is a range of support and opportunities for people to talk about differing faiths and cultures with someone who understands the culture that person is part of or can connect people to community groups for support.
- DPT recognises that across the NHS there are occasions where people from BAME communities are not treated properly or fairly, and their representatives were clear that even one occasion is too many. DPT is very clear that this not acceptable and that discrimination and unacceptable behaviour will be addressed. The organisation works to support its staff networks so there is a place for staff to speak up. There are also peer support workers – people with lived experience who now work on wards and in other community services to help others have a voice. DPT also works with various advocacy groups from different communities to support patients.
- Part of the equality, diversity and inclusion development and training for staff at DPT helps staff members to understand the impact of unacceptable behaviour. DPT is currently developing an inclusive leadership and behaviours programme and cultural competence training. A number of staff meetings have been held where expectations around language, being part of a team, respect and inclusivity are discussed.
- DPT has commissioned services from an Independent Guardian Service to support staff to speak freely if they need to raise something that they feel they couldn't do through normal organisational channels. DPT is proud of that arrangement and is moving to increase the different avenues for staff to voice their concerns so they can be listened to and learned from. The Guardian has direct access to the CEO and Chair and the CEO meets with the guardian every six months to discuss any issues or themes that need to be addressed.
- Where incidents have been raised with its Freedom to Speak Up Service, DPT employs appropriate responses to address and resolve issues. This may be; focused work with the relevant team to discuss the impact, reviewing the development programme to understand and reflect on the impact, reviewing processes to reduce the negative impact on service users, taking action with individual members of staff but, overall, always learning from the experience to improve and adapt systems and policies.
- DPT works closely with the voluntary sector, faith communities and other community groups to make sure people who require access to additional help and support, can be offered services in different ways and environments which suit them. DPT's range of services work together to improve access, experiences and outcomes for people who need its services before people need urgent or crisis services. However, the Trust recognises more needs to be done to ensure that people who might be reluctant to engage with its services, perhaps due to stigma, have a variety of opportunities to access services in a range of ways.

- DPT considers that its strengths in relation to equality and diversity are knowing and understanding the statistics around service users, which has driven a lot of positive work across the organisation as well as its ability to look for innovation or creativity from other areas and work with partners in the Integrated Care Organisation – which provides opportunities for local engagement and to drive local change. Another strength is the passion and commitment of DPT staff in the ways that they work to provide services for individuals at a local level.
- Regarding the disproportionate impact of COVID-19 on people from BAME groups, DPT tackled this early on by asking all teams to review their patient lists and have discussions with all members of staff, prioritising those from BAME communities to ensure that they had a proper risk assessment, that they received whatever protection and support they needed, and that they were prioritised for vaccination. DPT also worked closely with local communities and colleagues within the Integrated Care Organisation to provide additional support to service users.
- DPT had two complaints from people who identified as BAME in the last three years in relation to services they received. DPT will always meet with a complainant to discuss concerns, hear what they have to say, agree a complaints resolution plan with the complainant, learn from the findings and apologise when they get it wrong.
- DPT is part of a number of different networks including some relating to equality and diversity e.g. the Positive Practice Network. DPT's Learning from Experience work looks at cascades of information from other areas and has led to collaborative programmes around the overrepresentation of Black men using services, the use of restraint, health inequalities, supporting staff from different communities to have better development opportunities and reverse mentoring.
- In response to a question from a member of the public, DPT made assurances that there are robust referral and assessment systems and procedures in place to ensure people only receive the services they need. If service users present as a result of mental health trauma, due to incidents of racism, DPT could raise that issue with Devon and Cornwall Police.
- There is evidence nationally of an overrepresentation of young Black Afro-Caribbean men in mental health services and that systematic and constant racism in our society is a pressure which can contribute to mental health problems. DPT's TALKWORKS service is aimed at improving access to psychological therapy. The service has worked with the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, intersex plus community and now they're doing targeted work with BAME communities around the impact of discrimination on people's mental wellbeing.
- In response to a question from a member of the public DPT recommended that, to ensure reports on the issue of racism are acted on, there needs to be proper training in place across the workforce and people need to be supported and prepared to address these issues.
- DPT is keen to develop wider engagement forums so service users from all protected groups, backgrounds and communities can comfortably and confidently feedback about their services and issues can be discussed, addressed and action taken as early as possible.
- DPT works closely with the police and a range of wider partner organisations to respond to people in mental health crisis. Important developmental work in recent years has seen



these services evolve to include Street Triage, the Liaison and Diversion Service and the Joint Response Unit so there are practitioners working alongside the police to respond to people in mental health crisis. If there was a concern that anyone had acted in a discriminatory way, it would be raised with the police and the expectation is that the police would do the same.

- DPT is on a journey to improve support to its staff and people who use its services who are from the BAME community. Much of the work they described in the meeting is about making sure people's understanding and awareness, particularly in relation to cultural competence, is being developed. An inclusive recruitment processes is being further enhanced and making sure people have equal opportunities, ensuring clarity about DPT's zero tolerance of racism and discrimination, maintaining a strategic focus and priority of promoting social justice and making sure there are opportunities for people to speak up about issues and feel assured that those issues will be addressed.
- DPT emphasised the importance of reviews such as the Torbay Racism Review and talking to and learning from other organisations about what the issues are – and to share that learning. DPT would like to work with Torbay Council to engage with community groups.
- DPT stated that they are well prepared for another wave of COVID-19, from an infection control point of view, but there are concerns about capacity within services because of the evidenced impact of the pandemic on people's mental health, particularly with young people from BAME groups.
- Melanie Walker paid tribute to DPT staff, who perhaps don't get the same recognition as some other NHS staff do. It is a challenging job to work in mental health services, and it's been particularly so during the pandemic.